Agenda Item 9

PLANNING APPLICATIONS COMMITTEE 16 JANUARY 2020

APPLICATION NO 19/P3715	<u>.</u> <u>DATE VALID</u> 21/10/2019
Address/Site	34 Lingfield Road, Wimbledon, SW19 4PZ
Ward	Village
Proposal:	Demolition of existing garage and erection of a three-bedroom dwelling house involving extension to existing basement.
Drawing Nos	17480_PA_17F,18G,17480_PA_19F,17480_PA_20E, 17480_PA_21E, Design and Access Statement
Contact Officer:	Richard Allen (020 8545 3621)

RECOMMENDATION - GRANT Planning Permission subject to conditions

CHECKLIST INFORMATION

- Heads of agreement: No
- Is a screening opinion required: No
- Is an Environmental Impact Statement required: No
- Has an Environmental Impact Assessment been submitted: No
- Press notice- Yes
- Site notice-Yes
- Design Review Panel consulted-No
- Number neighbours consulted 18
- External consultants: None
- Density: n/a
- Number of jobs created: n/a
- Archaeology Priority Zone: Yes
- Controlled Parking Zone: Yes (CPZ VO)

1. **INTRODUCTION**

1.1 This application has been brought to the Planning Applications Committee due to the number of objections received.

2. SITE AND SURROUNDINGS

2.1 The application site comprises a detached garage located to the west side of 34 Lingfield Road, a large three storey detached dwelling house currently comprising 4 flats, situated on the south side of Lingfield Road. To the west of the site is 35 Lingfield Road, a large three storey detached dwelling house

currently comprising 4 flats. To the east of the site lies 33 Lingfield Road, a detached two storey building. Opposite the site to the north is a Listed Building. The application site is within the Merton (Wimbledon West) Conservation Area.

3. CURRENT PROPOSAL

- 3.1 The current proposal involves the demolition of the existing garage building and erection of a three-bedroom dwelling house involving extension to existing basement. The proposed dwelling house would be 21.5 metres in length, be between 5 and 6 metres in width and have an eaves height of 5.5 metres and have a pitched roof with a ridge height of 7.7 metres. The proposed dwelling would be set back from the site frontage by 8 metres.
- 3.2 Internally, at basement level a bedroom, study, utility and gym would be provided. At ground floor level an entrance hall, kitchen, dining and living room would be provided. At first floor level two bedrooms would be provided. The proposed house would have gross internal floor area (GIFI) of 230m2.
- 3.3 The proposed dwelling has been designed to be subservient to the existing building at 34 Lingfield Road (currently occupied as flats) and has a similar form to a traditional 'coach house' albeit in a contemporary style.
- 3.4 The existing plot of 34 Lingfield Road would be sub-divided to provide with the space occupied by the current garage site and the garden immediately to the rear of the existing garage allocated to the new dwelling house. A new fence would be erected at the rear dividing the garden.

4. **PLANNING HISTORY**

- 4.1 In April 1981 planning permission was granted for the erection of a detached garage (Ref.MER235/81).
- 4.2 In October 1986 planning permission was granted for the formation of storage space below the approved garage (Ref.MER795/86).
- 4.3 in June 2018 a pre-application meeting was held in respect of the demolition of the existing garage and erection of a three-bedroom dwelling house (LBM Ref.18/P0846).
- 4.4 In February 1019 a planning application was submitted for the demolition of the existing garage and erection of a three-bedroom dwelling house (LBM Ref.19/P0886). However, the application was withdrawn by the applicant on 7 June 2019.

5. **CONSULTATION**

5.1 The application has been advertised by Conservation Area site and press notice procedure and letters of notification to occupiers of neighbouring properties. In response 10 letters of objection have been received. The grounds of objection are set out below: -

-The occupier of the property opposite the application site (7 Lingfield Road) states that the large oversized windows to the front elevation will directly overlook number 7 Lingfield Road causing loss of privacy.

-Although the report states that there would be minimal loss of light this is not the case as its inevitable that a building will have a profound effect and cause loss of light to basement windows in 7 Lingfield Road.

-The building of an additional property will exacerbate parking problems in Lingfield Road.

-The contemporary design of the building is at odds with the rest of the road where there are no other buildings of this sort and the proposal will not improve the overall impression of an attractive road within a conservation area.

-The occupier of flat 1, Kingsley Court, 35 Lingfield Road states that the proposal will result in loss of light to flats 1 and 2.

-The tenant of flat 2, 34 Lingfield Road has a right of access via the in/out driveway and the proposed development would block the access.

-The proposed building is a disproportionately tall, narrow building with oversized windows to the front and rear and obtrusive windows to the western elevation overlooking number 35 Lingfield Road.

-The proposed development would be an eyesore in the conservation area. The recent application at 1A Lingfield road retained the façade of the original building.

5.3 <u>Conservation Officer</u>

As submitted the Conservation Officer expressed concern regarding the proportions of the windows to the front elevation of the proposed dwelling. Following discussions with officers the design of the windows to the front elevation of the proposed dwelling were revised and reduced in width. The Conservation Officer has no objections to the revised window arrangement.

5.4 <u>Tree Officer</u>

The tree officer has no objections to the proposed development subject to the existing (neighbouring) trees being protected during the development.

5.5 <u>Flood Risk Manager</u> No comments received – To be updated on mods sheet.

6. **POLICY CONTEXT**

6.1 <u>Adopted Merton Core Strategy (July 2011)</u>

CS6 (Wimbledon Sub-Area), CS8 (Housing Choice), CS9 (Housing Provision), CS11 (Infrastructure), CS13 (Open Space, Nature Conservation, Leisure and Culture), CS14 (Design), CS15 (Climate Change), CS16 (Flood Risk Management), CS17 (Waste Management), CS18 (Active Transport), CS19 (Public Transport) and CS20 (Parking, Servicing and Delivery).

6.2 <u>Sites and Policies Plan (July 2014)</u>

DM O2 (Nature conservation, Trees, Hedges and Landscape Features), DM H2 (Housing Mix), DM D2 (Design Considerations in all Developments), DM D4 (Managing Heritage Assets), DM EP4 (Pollutants), DM F1 (Support for Flood Risk Management), DM F2 (Sustainable Urban Drainage Systems (SuDS) and; Wastewater and Water Infrastructure), DM T1 (Support for Sustainable Transport and active Travel), DM T2 (Transport Impacts of Development), DM T3 (Car Parking and Servicing Standards) and DM T5 (Access to the Road Network).

6.3 The London Plan (2016)

Increasing Housing Supply), 3.4 (Optimising Sites potential), 3.5 (Quality and Design of Housing), 3.8 (Housing Choice), 3.9 (Mixed and Balanced Communities), 5.1 (Climate Change Mitigation),5.2 (Minimising Carbon Dioxide Emissions), 5.3 (Sustainable Design and Construction), 5.7 (renewable Energy), 5.11 (Green Roofs and Development Site Environs), 5.13 (Sustainable Drainage), 6.3 (Assessing Effects of Development on Transport Capacity), 6.9 (Cycling), 6.10 (Walking), 6.13 (Parking), 7.2 (An Inclusive Environment), 7.3 (Designing Out Crime), 7.4 (Local Character), 7.6 (Architecture), 7.8 (Heritage assets and Archaeology), 7.14 (Improving Air Quality), 7.19 (Biodiversity and Access to Nature) and 7.21 (Trees and Woodlands).

6.4 Other guidance:

West Wimbledon Conservation Area Character Assessment 2003 DCLG Technical Housing Standards – Nationally Described Space Standards 2016 The National Planning Policy Framework 2019 The National Design Guide (2019) Draft London Plan (2019)

7. PLANNING CONSIDERATIONS

- 7.1 The main planning considerations concern design/conservation, basement construction, neighbour amenity, impact on trees, parking/cycle parking, sustainability and refuse and recycling issues.
- 7.2 <u>Design/Conservation Issues</u>
- 7.2.1 Policy DM D4 (Managing Heritage Assets) of the Adopted Merton Sites and Polices Plan (2014) seeks to conserve and where appropriate enhance Merton's heritage assets and distinctive character. The proposed new dwelling would be subservient to the existing residential building and the neighbouring flats at 35 Lingfield Road.
- 7.2.2 The south side of Lingfield road immediately adjacent to the application site is characterised by large detached mansion blocks set within large plots. Opposite the application site on the north side of Lingfield Road are more modest two storey/two and a half story terraced, semi-detached and detached dwellings within smaller plots. The application property comprises a large Villa occupied as four flats with a large detached garage sited between the Villa

and the boundary with 35 Lingfield Road. The application site is one of the largest plots in Lingfield Road and there are no objections to the principle of demolition of the existing garage and constructing a new detached dwelling house in its place.

7.2.3 The new house will present a gabled frontage with asymmetrical window openings onto Lingfield Road. The adopted design makes reference to the vernacular forms and uses traditional materials such as facing brickwork and clay roof tiles. Visual interest would be created by the use of soldier course brickwork and the roof drainage is concealed, with rainwater pipes run within the external walls. The contemporary design approach is for a neatly detailed, modern version of a family home with a discreet impact upon the street scene. Windows have been designed to maximise daylight into the proposed house and consideration has been given to the position of windows so that there is no overlooking onto neighbouring properties. The proposed building would be set slightly back from the front building line of the main building (No.340, and thus respecting the street scene. The proposed dwelling would maintain a 1.0 m gap to the west boundary and maintain a large gap to the existing mansion block of number 34. Taking this into account, and the overall scale and size of the new dwelling, officers are satisfied that the 'infilling' of this gap with the dwelling proposed would not cause a harmful impact on the character of the Conservation Area and streetscene. A sample of materials condition is recommended to ensure that the finished brickwork to be used would be high quality and suitable. The proposal is therefore acceptable in terms of polices policies CS14 (Design) and DM D2 (Design Considerations in all Developments), DM D3 (Alterations and Extensions to Existing Buildings) and DM D4 (Managing Heritage Assets).

7.3 Basement Construction

- 7.3.1 The current proposal involves the enlargement of the existing basement as part of the proposed new dwelling. The existing garage has a basement of 66m2 floor space. The existing basement would be incorporated into the new development with a small increase in floor space (25m2) to give a total basement floor space of 91m2 (including the light well to the rear garden elevation). The basement extension would extend to the rear and thus limiting its visual impact to the rear, where a lightwell would serve it for access to natural light. There are no objections to the enlargement of the existing basement in connection with construction of a new dwelling house as it would be of a small-scale addition. The submitted Drainage Report outlines that a large part of the site would remain permeable and that measures proposed include a green roof and a rainwater harvesting tank. The provision of an enlarged basement is considered to be acceptable in terms of policy DM D2 (Design Considerations in all Developments).
- 7.4 <u>Neighbour Amenity</u>
- 7.4.1 Although there would be windows within the side elevation of the proposed dwelling facing number 35 Lingfield Road, two windows at ground level would be secondary to a kitchen and bathroom and two windows at first floor level would be secondary to bedrooms. The position of the windows would not

result in any undue overlooking and/or loss of privacy to number 35 Lingfield Road as the first floor windows can be obscurely glazed, controlled via condition. Although there are windows to flats within the side elevation of 34 Lingfield Road facing the application site, the proposed dwelling would be set off the boundary with 34 Lingfield Road and the window within the side elevation of the new dwelling would serve a stairwell.

- 7.4.2 The proposal will result in an uplift in built form in comparison to the existing garage. The application has been accompanied with a Daylight/Sunlight Report which has assessed the effects on surrounding neighbouring windows. To the west of the site lies 35 Lingfield Road, which comprises 3 flats. The assessment has assessed the effects on the side facing windows on number 35, which would face towards the proposal. The assessment concludes that the impact of the proposal would still maintain appropriate levels of daylight and sunlight, in line with the BRE Guidelines. Officers note the objections and accompanying photographs from the neighbouring occupiers of the basement flat (Flat 1) at number 35. Whilst officers acknowledge that there would be some impact on daylight and sunlight to the basement side window and to the window above serving Flat 2, the effects would not be severe and an appropriate level of natural light would remain.
- 7.4.3 A number of other windows have been assessed on numbers 7-9 Lingfield Road and 34 Lingfield Rioad which demonstrates the proposal would not have a harmful impact on these neighbouring windows.
- 7.4.4 Taking into account the uplift in built form and the results of the Daylight/Sunlight analysis, officers do not consider that the proposed new dwelling would cause a materially harmful impact on daylight or sunlight received to neighbouring habitable rooms.
- 7.4.5 Therefore, the proposed new dwelling is not considered to have such a detrimental impact upon neighbour amenity as to warrant refusal of the application.
- 7.4.6 The proposed rear section extending into the garden would be single storey with a flat roof. Taking into account the single storey nature and limited height, officers are satisfied that the depth and position of this section of the proposed dwelling would not cause material harm to the amenities of the occupiers to the west at 35 Lingfield Road.
- 7.4.7 The proposal is considered to be acceptable in terms of policy DM D2 (Design Considerations in all Developments).
- 7.5 <u>Trees</u>
- 7.5.1 The Council's Tree officer has no objections to the proposed development subject to tree protection conditions being imposed on any grant of planning permission. The trees to be removed are category C trees (low value) and a landscaping scheme can be secured through condition seeking additional tree planting. The proposals are therefore considered to be acceptable in terms of

policy DM O2 (Nature Conservation, Trees, Hedges and Landscape Features).

7.6 Parking/Cycle Parking/Refuse and Recycling

7.6.1 The proposal would provide two off-street car parking spaces for the new dwelling house and covered cycle storage for two cycles. One parking space would also be retained for use by flat 2 in 34 Lingfield Road. The proposal would also provide a refuse and recycling store, separate from the existing flats. A new refuse and recycling store would be provided for the existing four flats at 34 Longfield Road, located the eastern boundary of the site. There is adequate space within the front garden for the construction of a new refuse store to accommodate the eight bins required for the existing four flats. There is an existing parking space allocated for the ground floor flat. The three other flats do not have allocated parking spaces. The existing parking space would be retained and two new spaces provided on part of the existing 'in/out' driveway in front of the property. The provision of two spaces for the new dwelling is considered to be acceptable in this instance. It is not considered there would be a significant effect on on-street parking arising from the proposal. Officers note the objections regarding rights of access for one of the flats at number 34 over the front area of the site, however, this is a civil matter and not for the Council to get involved. The proposal is therefore considered to be acceptable in terms of policy CS20 (Parking).

7.7 <u>Sustainability</u>

7.7.1 All new developments comprising the creation of a new dwelling should demonstrate how the development will comply with Merton's Core Planning Strategy (2011) Policy CS15 Climate Change (parts a-d) and the policies outlined in Chapter 5 of the London Plan (2016). As a minor development proposal, the development is required to achieve a 19% improvement on Part L of the Building Regulations 2013 and water consumption should not exceed 105 lires/person/day.

8. <u>SUSTAINABILITY AND ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT ASSESSMENT</u> <u>REQUIREMENTS</u>

8.1 The proposal does not constitute Schedule 1 or Schedule 2 development. Accordingly, there is no requirement for an EIA submission.

9. CONCLUSION

9.1 The design of the proposed dwelling is considered to be acceptable and the proposal would not harm neighbour amenity. The proposal would also preserve the character an appearance of the Merton (Wimbledon West) Conservation Area. Accordingly, it is recommended that planning permission be granted, subject to conditions.

RECOMMENDATION

GRANT PLANNING PERMISSION

Subject to the following conditions: -

- 1. A.1 (Commencement of Development)
- 2. A.7 (Approved Plans)
- 3. B.1 (Approval of Facing Materials)
- 4. B.4 (Details of Surface Treatment)
- 5. C.1 (No Permitted Development)
- 6. C.2 (No Permitted Development-Windows and Doors)
- 7. C.6 (Refuse and Recycling-Details to be Submitted)
- 8. D.11 (Hours of Construction)
- 9. F.1 (Landscaping Scheme)
- 10. H.4 (Provision of Parking)
- 11. Prior to commencement of development a Basement Construction Method Statement shall be submitted to and be approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority and the development completed in accordance with the approved details.

Reason for condition: In the interest of neighbour amenity and to comply with policy DM D2 of the Adopted Merton Sites and Polices Plan (2014).

- 12. F.5 (Tree Protection)
- 13. C.8 (No Use of Flat Roof)
- 14. H.4 (Provision of Parking)
- 15. <u>Method of Construction Statement</u>
- 16. <u>Obscure Glazing (first floor side facing windows)</u>
- 17. Details of Green Roof and water harvesting tank
- 18. INF1 (Party Wall Act)

<u>Click Here</u> for full plans and documents related to this application